



Dialogue Process about Chronic Renal Insufficiency

Facilitator's Summary

April 30, 2009

1. Background

On April 29 and 30, 2009, in the city of León, the fourth dialog meeting was held, convened by the Office of the Compliance Advisor/Ombudsman of the World Bank Group (CAO) with the participation of Nicaragua Sugar Estates Limited (NSEL) and the Asociación Chichigalpa por la Vida (ASOCHIVIDA), with the purpose of finding solutions to the problem of Chronic Renal Insufficiency (CRI).

This process has been conducted under the guidelines set in the Framework Agreement for the Dialogue (*Acuerdo Marco para el Diálogo*), proposed by CAO on November 20 2008, to which NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA have acceded separately. According to point 6 of said Framework Agreement, the dialog meetings shall be centered on, and limited to:

- a) **Identifying and addressing the causes of CRI.** The subscribers agree to define, jointly, the criteria and principles necessary to carry out a Study to identify the causes of CRI, the results of which shall be transparent and reliable for all and provide feasible solutions.
- i) Expected results: An Agreement on the criteria and principles that will guide the Study. An Agreement to accept the results of the Study and the options for solutions to the problem.
- b) **Options to support the local communities where there exists a prevalence of CRI.** Out of good will and without any legal obligation, the subscribers agree to look for ways to alleviate the situations of the families affected by IRC, involving local resources and State institutions.
 - i) Expected Result: Relief of the situation of families affected by CRI.

2. Developments

Point 6.a of the Framework Agreement

After completing the activities detailed in the previous facilitator's summary (April 3), CAO requested proposals from public agencies (9), universities in the Americas and Europe (22), private consulting institutions (5) and published them in its webpage.

On April 3, 2009, CAO received nine proposals, of which four corresponded to prestigious universities and five to private consulting institutions. As of that date, CAO initiated the process of revision of the proposals submitted, following the matrix of criteria and scoring that had been shared with the participants of the Dialogue Table.

Since in the chronogram proposed to and agreed upon by the participants it was decided to jointly select the institution that would carry out the study, CAO held separate and preparatory meetings with the participants, to analyze the proposals received and reflect upon them before making a decision.



OFFICE OF THE COMPLIANCE ADVISOR/OMBUDSMAN
2121 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, NW • WASHINGTON, DC 20433, USA
TELEPHONE (202) 458-1973 • FACSIMILE (202) 522-7400
E-MAIL: CAO-COMPLIANCE@IFC.ORG • INTERNET: WWW.CAO-OMBUDSMAN.ORG

As a result of the dialog meeting, the participants agreed to select Boston University and request the inclusion of a pathologist and a geneticist. In further agreement with the proposed criteria, accepted by all parties in February 2009, of resorting only to foreign institutions, so as to promote absolute independence, they also decided to request from Boston University the exclusion of the institution for local support they had proposed to work with and not to include institutions from Central America or institutions which had previously worked on this issue in Nicaragua.

As a next step, CAO shall communicate, with Boston University, the decision made by the participants and advance in the elaboration of their contract to perform the study, the duration of which is foreseen as three months. As was detailed in the next-step section of the previous summary, an evaluation is expected to be concluded of the scope for this study, with an analysis of the options for epidemiological studies that indicates the probability to attain conclusive answers to the question of NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA, defines the effort and time required for each and objectively evaluates the limitations and uncertainties associated with this type of studies.

Point 6.b of the Framework Agreement

According to the previous facilitator's summary (April 3), out of good will and without any legal obligation, NSEL shall provide short-term assistance to alleviate the situation of the families affected by CRI, insofar as food, schooling and health.

To implement food assistance, the approval of the American Nicaraguan Foundation Board (ANF) is expected soon, in order to begin distribution. With the approval of the Board, representatives of ANF shall communicate with representatives of ASOCHIVIDA to inform on how the assistance will be channeled. It is considered important that ASOCHIVIDA may work internally to define distribution criteria, according to the number of family members.

Meanwhile, in compliance with the agreement, representatives of NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA have requested the Mayor's cooperation to obtain copies of birth certificates. Mr. Mayor has expressed his willingness to help. ASOCHIVIDA, in turn, has completed the compilation of information of approximately 1100 family heads and handed to CAO the copies of all their documents. CAO has made a list of the names and file numbers for each family head and shall give all the information to Dr. Félix Zelaya at NSEL.

As to health, NSEL has purchased the ultrasound equipment and will deliver it to the Health Center on May 14. The best juridical form for the delivery it is still need to be defined, so as to ensure that the ultrasound will be used for the purposes agreed upon in this process of dialog. There is also progress in the selection of a radiologist, who will be hired for the ultrasound equipment. Representatives of NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA have met with Dr. Reyes of the Chichigalpa Health Center, to analyze what medicines and reactives it would be convenient for NSEL to contribute. NSEL and ASOCHIVIDA would like this assistance to materialize as soon as possible and they are aware that it might take a little longer than expected, as it is necessary to coordinate with the corresponding state institutions.

Finally, it had been agreed that NSEL would provide two hemodialysis machines. As to this issue, it is necessary to obtain more information on the number of people that wish and can have access to this treatment, both owing to the state of their health and to their living conditions. ASOCHIVIDA shall work with Dr. Reyes in this respect.



OFFICE OF THE COMPLIANCE ADVISOR/OMBUDSMAN
2121 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, NW • WASHINGTON, DC 20433, USA
TELEPHONE (202) 458-1973 • FACSIMILE (202) 522-7400
E-MAIL: CAO-COMPLIANCE@IFC.ORG • INTERNET: WWW.CAO-OMBUDSMAN.ORG

Schooling assistance and support for alternative sources of income and employment, sustainable over time, were not addressed in this meeting and shall be resumed at the next opportunity.

Encouraged by the attitude of cooperation shown again during this meeting, CAO has expressed to ASOCHIVIDA and NSEL its willingness to continue supporting this process of dialog and the will to communicate to other institutions the advancements achieved.

3. Next steps

According to CAO's criteria, the next steps in this process of dialog should be oriented to:

Point 6.a of the Framework Agreement

- Hold a dialog meeting with the Boston University team, to get to know and comment their work plan.

Point 6.b of the Framework Agreement

- Continue with the implementation of food, schooling and medical short-term assistance, within the stated timeframes.
- Begin the dialog on the recommendations submitted in Dr. David Silver's report, aiming at the integral improvement of the health system response to CRI.
- Begin the dialog on the development of alternative sustainable sources of income and employment for ex-workers and their families. To this effect, incorporate the technician who can support ASOCHIVIDA during the analysis of different project options.
- Begin a dialog about when and how to incorporate in the process of dialog other public and private institutions, whose participation may contribute to broaden the scope and sustainability of the solutions being designed for the problem of CRI.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Juan Dumas', is positioned above the printed name.

Juan Dumas
Dialogue Facilitator

Director Ejecutivo de la Fundación Futuro Latinoamericano